



MARKSCHEME

November 2008

HISTORY

Higher Level and Standard Level

Paper 1

*This markscheme is **confidential** and for the exclusive use of examiners in this examination session.*

*It is the property of the International Baccalaureate and must **not** be reproduced or distributed to any other person without the authorization of IB Cardiff.*

SECTION A

Prescribed Subject 1 The USSR under Stalin, 1924 to 1941

These questions relate to the extent of Stalin's power in the 1930s.

1. (a) **What, according to Source B, were the aims of the 1933–1934 purge of the Communist Party?** [3 marks]

- It was aimed at general housekeeping tasks within the Party
- it wanted to remove those who were opposed to the Party and its policies
- it wanted to remove enemies who were seeking to subvert Party policy
- it aimed at improving the Party's administrative structures.

Award [1 mark] for each relevant point made to a maximum of [3 marks].

- (b) **What message is conveyed by Source D?** [2 marks]

The message that is being conveyed by Source D is that:

- a powerful communist Kirov has died – and is receiving a state funeral
- Stalin is appearing to honour Kirov as he is a pall bearer
- by participating in the funeral Stalin was attempting to distance himself from responsibility for Kirov's death.

Award [1 mark] for plausible suggestions of the photograph's message and [1 mark] for an explanation up to a maximum of [2 marks].

N.B. Do not enter half marks or + and – but compensate between (a) and (b) if necessary for a final mark out of [5 marks].

2. **Compare and contrast the views expressed about the extent of Stalin's power in Sources A and E.** [6 marks]

For comparison:

- both agree that Stalin was in a position of power
- both see the role of Politburo as important
- both see the Party as the source of policy making.

For contrast:

- Source A refers to Stalin as the most powerful man in Russia whereas Source E states Stalin could not always get his policies adopted
- Source A states the Politburo was the centre of power and Source E refers to important leaders as being on both the Politburo and the Central Committee
- Source E also states that the Party's power had to be maintained implying that the Central Committee and the Soviets could be a threat
- Source E provides specific evidence of political dissent (Ryutin).

Do not demand all the above and credit all valid claims. If only one source is discussed award a maximum of *[2 marks]*. If the two sources are discussed separately award *[3 marks]* or with excellent linkage *[4 to 5 marks]*. For maximum *[6 marks]* expect a detailed running comparison and contrast. Award up to *[5 marks]* if two sources are linked/integrated in **either** a running comparison **or** contrast.

3. With reference to their origin and purpose, assess the value and limitations of Source C and Source E for historians studying Russia in the 1930s. [6 marks]

Source C:

Origin: official history of the Communist Party authorised by the Central Committee published in 1939.

Purpose: to justify the events of the mid 1930s, the elimination of Stalin's rivals – all members of Lenin's Politburo.

Value: an example of the official version of events, a good example of propaganda trying to encourage nationalist and socialist enthusiasm.

Limitations: the fact that it is propaganda can also be a limitation as it is what Stalin and the Party wanted people to believe. Heavily censored as published in 1939 and authorised by the Central Committee.

Source E:

Origin: a recent, well-researched, text – objective. Published in 2002.

Purpose: to analyse events and to inform about events in Stalin's Russia.

Value: written in after 1990 and therefore had access to Soviet archives, benefit of hindsight.

Limitations: the source is covering three major dictators and may therefore lack fully detailed information about Russia in the 1930s.

Do not expect all of the above. Ideally there will be a balance between the two sources and each source can be marked out of *[3 marks]*, but allow a *[4/2 mark]* split. If only one source is assessed mark out of *[4 marks]*. For a maximum of *[6 marks]* candidates must refer to the origin, purpose, value and limitations of both sources in their assessment.

4. Using these sources and your own knowledge how far do you agree that Stalin's power in the late 1930s was due to his dominance of the Communist Party? *[8 marks]*

Source material:

Source A: refers to the Party's power and the importance of Stalin's role as General Secretary.

Source B: refers to enemies within the Party ranks and the failure of the 1933–1934 purge, necessitating other campaigns in 1935 and 1936.

Source C: shows how other leading communists, such as Zinoviev and Kamenev, were eliminated in the 1930s, accused of treason.

Source D: the death of Kirov in 1934 removed a potential rival in the Party.

Source E: supports Source B and shows that in the early 1930s Stalin was less powerful, that there was dissent in the Party, particularly by Ryutin.

Own knowledge:

Could include a brief reference to the struggle for power, the elimination of 1108 delegates from the 1934 so-called Congress of Victors when Stalin was secretly criticised. Candidates could also refer to the purges and show trials, the destruction of the Red Army and the cult of personality throughout the Soviet Union portraying Stalin as a fatherly figure. There was relative stability economically as the worst excesses of the first Five Year Plan and forced collectivization had moderated after 1933. Candidates could also refer to the nature of the Soviet state with Party organizations parallel to government organizations.

Do not expect all of the above, and credit other relevant material. If only source material or only own knowledge is used, the maximum mark that can be obtained is *[5 marks]*. For maximum *[8 marks]* expect argument, synthesis of source material and own knowledge, as well as references to the sources used.

SECTION B

Prescribed Subject 2 The emergence and development of the People's Republic of China (PRC), 1946 to 1964

These questions relate to the political consolidation of China after 1949.

5. (a) **What, according to Source A, did Mao believe were the lessons learned from the past, and the direction that China's future policies should take?** [3 marks]

- Experience has shown how to defeat an enemy using a united front of the revolutionary classes under the leadership of the Party
- the CPC has learnt by its errors and should correct mistakes quickly
- a dictatorship is needed of an alliance between workers and peasants led by the Party.

Award [1 mark] for each relevant point made to a maximum of [3 marks].

- (b) **What information is conveyed by Source C?** [2 marks]

- The structure operates from the base upwards from primary organizations at the lowest level to the Central Committee at the top; it is a vertical structure
- control is enforced from the top down by the Politburo and the Central Committee.

Award [1 mark] for plausible suggestions of the table's message and [1 mark] for an explanation up to a maximum of [2 marks].

N.B. Do not enter half marks or + and – but compensate between (a) and (b) if necessary for a final mark out of [5 marks].

6. **Compare and contrast the views expressed about the means by which political consolidation occurred in China in Sources C and E.** [6 marks]

For comparison:

- both C and E indicate that on the face of it there is a clear structure within the hierarchy
- both sources identify the Central Committee, provincial committees and congresses, and county committees as levels within the structure; although C also deals with smaller local bases
- both sources identify the methods by which decisions are made.

For contrast:

- Source E indicates that the PLA and its military regions also contributed to consolidation
- Source E also indicates that the CPC is an elitist organization
- Source E maintains that the supposed egalitarian structure is inaccurate, that the elections were rigged and that power is only in the hands of the Central Committee and Politburo
- Source C goes into more details about how the structure should function – through the use of departments.

Do not demand all the above and credit all valid claims. If only one source is discussed award a maximum of *[2 marks]*. If the two sources are discussed separately award *[3 marks]* or with excellent linkage *[4 to 5 marks]*. For maximum *[6 marks]* expect a detailed running comparison and contrast. Award up to *[5 marks]* if two sources are linked/integrated in **either** a running comparison **or** contrast.

7. **With reference to their origin and purpose, assess the value and limitations of Source B and Source D for historians studying the political consolidation of China under Mao.** *[6 marks]*

Source B:

- Origin: an extract from The Common Program of the CPPCC from September 29 1949.
- Purpose: to show the measures passed by the new government to hasten reform in the PRC. It is also intending to get support from the people for the new government.
- Value: it is one of the first pieces of legislation passed by the new government and clearly shows some of the new measures that this government will implement. It gives the view of the government at that time vis-à-vis the Chinese people and Article 1 shows the groupings identified by the government as being significant.
- Limitations: although the Program promises much, there is no way of knowing if the government intends to fulfill the promises it is making. Articles 4 and 5 clearly indicate democratic changes which are to be made but Article 1 mentions a democratic dictatorship which is a contradiction in terms. It could be seen as propaganda to get support, but only events in the future will show if these changes are to be fully implemented.

Source D:

- Origin: an extract from Mao's China and After, written by Maurice Meisner an American academic and published in New York in 1999.
- Purpose: to provide a scholarly examination of political developments and changes within China after the death of Mao Zedong in 1976.
- Value: it is a historical work and, provided the author has researched and referenced his work thoroughly, it could present a balanced overall account, with the benefit of objectivity and hindsight.
- Limitations: the political stance of the writer is not stated, but it is published in the West and may be subjective in approach. It is not known if the author can read Chinese or if he has had access to Chinese documents

Do not expect all of the above. Ideally there will be a balance between the two sources, and each source can be marked out of *[3 marks]*, but allow a *[4/2 mark]* split. If only one source is assessed mark out of *[4 marks]*. For a maximum of *[6 marks]* candidates must refer to the origin, purpose, value and limitations of both sources in their assessment.

8. Using these sources and your own knowledge explain to what extent the actual political practice of the new state honoured the promise of “these elementary democratic rights” (Source D) up to 1957. [8 marks]

Source material:

Source A: indicates that self-criticism is necessary and that mistakes need to be rapidly rectified. Better candidates will link this to their own knowledge and refer to specific policies such as the 3 and 5 Antis or the Hundred Flowers campaign.

Source B: mentions the elementary democratic rights that should be introduced – elections, freedom of thought, speech, assembly, *etc.* Candidates can make judgements about whether or not these were honoured.

Source C: indicates that, despite the illusion of grass roots democracy as the power is top-down rather than bottom up, the state did not honour its promises as the CPC was controlling what was happening within the new state.

Source D: refers to the Common Program but implies that what was going to happen was contrary to what was promised when it mentions the actual political practices of the new state.

Source E: clearly shows the role of the PLA in controlling the state and the importance of the role of provincial committees (only 26 for the whole of the PRC). It indicates that the CPC is elitist and has very strict control over the committees. It also mentions that elections were conducted for the sake of appearance, and not really democratic.

Own knowledge could include mention of any policies which support or refute the statement. These could include the Marriage Reform Law, education, the Agrarian Reform Law, the 3 and 5 Antis, the Hundred Flowers campaign or the Anti-Rightist Movement. Material should primarily be drawn from social and political policies although economic policies could be included as minor supporting data. It is important that candidates explicitly link these policies to whichever direction they are taking in their answers.

Do not expect all of the above, and credit other relevant material. If only source material or only own knowledge is used, the maximum mark that can be obtained is **[5 marks]**. For maximum **[8 marks]** expect argument, synthesis of source material and own knowledge, as well as references to the sources used.

SECTION C

Prescribed Subject 3 The Cold War, 1960 to 1979

These questions relate to United States Cold War policies and the Vietnam War.

9. (a) **Why, according to Source A, did President Johnson believe it was necessary to ask for congressional action?** **[3 marks]**

- due to North Vietnamese attacks on US naval vessels
- to support freedom and protect peace in South East Asia
- to fulfil obligations under the South East Asia Collective Defense Treaty
- to meet communist aggression against nations in the area.

Award **[1 mark]** for each relevant point made to a maximum of **[3 marks]**.

- (b) **What message is conveyed by Source C?** **[2 marks]**

[1 mark] could be awarded by indicating that the message of the cartoon was the United States' military involvement in Vietnam.

[2 marks] would require more development, examples could include the fog, or smoke (indicating war); clouds hiding where the stairs lead indicating a lack of clarity in policy decisions, the steep nature of the stairs with nothing to hold on to on either side may be seen indicating the great risk involved in the action.

Award **[1 mark]** for plausible suggestions of the cartoon's message and **[1 mark]** for an explanation up to a maximum of **[2 marks]**.

N.B. Do not enter half marks or + and – but compensate between (a) and (b) if necessary for a final mark out of **[5 marks]**.

10. Compare and contrast the views expressed about United States military involvement in Vietnam in Sources A and D. [6 marks]

For comparison:

- both sources address American South East Asian policy and Vietnam
- both sources acknowledge that a North Vietnamese attack on US naval vessels occurred
- both sources indicate that the decision would be tied to a South East Asian treaty agreement.

For contrast:

- Source D indicates a clear disagreement with the policy direction stated in Source A
- Source A states that this is a necessary act to maintain peace in the area while Source D states that this is a result of an aggressive US policy in South East Asia
- President Johnson in Source A calls for a multilateral action obligating the United States and other members to act, while Senator Gruening in Source D calls this a unilateral action on the part of the United States
- in Source A President Johnson sees this as an obligation the US is required to fulfil, while Senator Gruening sees this as a war in which the US has no business and into which it has been misguidedly drawn.

Do not demand all the above and credit all valid claims. If only one source is discussed award a maximum of *[2 marks]*. If the two sources are discussed separately award *[3 marks]* or with excellent linkage *[4 to 5 marks]*. For maximum *[6 marks]* expect a detailed running comparison and contrast. Award up to *[5 marks]* if two sources are linked/integrated in **either** a running comparison **or** contrast.

11. **With reference to their origin and purpose, assess the value and limitations of Source B and Source E for historians studying the United States involvement in the Vietnam War.** **[6 marks]**

Source B:

Origin: a resolution passed by the House and Senate of the United States Congress on August 7, 1964.

Purpose: to state support for, and approval of, action that will be taken by the President to repel any armed attack against US forces and to take any necessary steps to assist a member of the South East Asian Collective Defense Treaty in maintaining freedom.

Value: this is an official US government document indicating government policy in South East Asia. It indicates support for the administration's policy by members of Congress. This document also clearly shows historians that the United States Government saw South East Asia as an important area impacting on US security.

Limitations: the document is somewhat vague with specific actions and policies not being addressed. The threat of war would make it difficult for Congress not to support President Johnson.

Source E:

Origin: this is an excerpt from an Associated Press news article on November 9 1995 reporting on Robert McNamara's trip to Hanoi and a meeting with Vietnamese officials, including General Vo Nguyen Giap. McNamara and Giap are quoted in the excerpt.

Purpose: as a news article it reflects the intention of the news agency to inform the public about events the specific agency feels are newsworthy. The article itself highlights the interaction between McNamara and Giap concerning the Gulf of Tonkin incident.

Value: the article is from a reputable news organization. Historians are hearing reasons for actions that were taken given by participants in the actual events. This source would indicate that McNamara continued to have doubts about the events of August 4, 1964 in the Gulf of Tonkin.

Limitation: this meeting is taking place years after the events and both of the individuals may have reasons for wanting a particular version of the events to be the public record.

Do not expect all of the above. Ideally there will be a balance between the two sources, and each one can be marked out of **[3 marks]**, but allow a **[4/2 mark]** split. If only one source is assessed mark out of **[4 marks]**. For a maximum of **[6 marks]** candidates must refer to the origin, purpose, value and limitations of both sources in their assessment.

12. Using these sources and your own knowledge examine the reasons for the United States escalating its military involvement in the Vietnam War in the mid 1960s. *[8 marks]*

Source material:

Source A: indicates that President Johnson was driven by hostile attacks and the desire to protect freedom and peace in South East Asia, particularly to keep longstanding US commitments to the South East Asia Collective Defence Treaty. Johnson implies that to do this may require more US military involvement.

Source B: this document shows the US Congress' commitment to allow the President to take any necessary action to repel aggressive armed attacks, which would clearly indicate the impact of the Gulf of Tonkin action. It also identifies the longstanding treaty commitments to the area for defence.

Source C: the cartoon indicates the sending of troops to Vietnam and implies the risk of escalation as well as the limited vision as to where such a decision will lead.

Source D: this shows Senator Gruening representing a position that this escalation is simply a part of a larger, more aggressive US policy in the area that does not start with the Gulf of Tonkin but earlier and through SEATO will place the nation in a wider conflict over more than Vietnam.

Source E: indicates that it is possible that no action took place on August 4, 1964 that should have caused an escalation of US involvement. But the candidate could address McNamara's question as showing that he was not sure what had occurred which could imply that actions were taken on the basis of limited information as opposed to fabricating the action for purposes of moving toward escalation.

Own knowledge could address the long-term concerns for containment and the "domino theory" applied to Asia. Actions taken by the Eisenhower and particularly the Kennedy administration toward more US involvement could be discussed with particular emphasis on the Diem regime and American commitment. Concerns raised by US military advisors in Vietnam as to policy changes may also be addressed. Candidates may examine the larger causes for American involvement while addressing the actions in the Gulf of Tonkin as a method by which to escalate that involvement.

Do not expect all of the above, and credit other relevant material. If only source material or only own knowledge is used, the maximum mark that can be obtained is *[5 marks]*. For maximum *[8 marks]* expect argument, synthesis of source material and own knowledge, as well as references to the sources used.
